



E-PARCC

COLLABORATIVE GOVERNANCE INITIATIVE

Syracuse University

Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs

Program for the Advancement of Research on Conflict and Collaboration

Education in Adlabad

Teaching Note

Overview

“Education in Adlabad” is a role play simulation designed to illuminate the complexities and challenges of public administration and management in an international network setting characterized by significant ambiguity, expectations for collaboration, and divisive organizational politics.

The role play requires actors from five organizations to come together and negotiate plans for the redevelopment of education in the country of Adlabad. The role play is primarily fictitious, although instructors and students are likely to catch on to the real world inspiration for the role play: Afghanistan.

The role play can be used in a broad range of courses, including but not limited to public administration, public policy, political science, conflict resolution, collaboration, and international relations, among others.

In terms of conflict and collaboration, the role play can be used to help students identify positions and interests, understand the role of values in conflict situations, and develop skills and capacities in conflict analysis and resolution, negotiation, facilitation, and collaboration.

In terms of other disciplinary/substantive areas, the role play allows students to experience how the tensions between public administration and democracy manifest in the context of international policy making and public administration. For example, the role play touches on issues such as the meaning of democracy, the proper role of bureaucracy and public administrators, tensions between bureaucratic, democratic, and cultural values, discretion and accountability, citizen involvement and participation, and the influence of non-state and international actors on sovereignty/autonomy, among others.

This simulation was a winner in our 2011-12 “Collaborative Public Management, Collaborative Governance, and Collaborative Problem Solving” teaching case and simulation competition. It was double-blind peer reviewed by a committee of academics and practitioners. It was written by Tina Nabatchi of Syracuse University. This case is intended for classroom discussion and is not intended to suggest either effective or ineffective handling of the situation depicted. It is brought to you by E-PARCC, part of the Maxwell School of Syracuse University’s Collaborative Governance Initiative, a subset of the Program for the Advancement of Research on Conflict and Collaboration (PARCC). This material may be copied as many times as needed as long as the authors are given full credit for their work.

This role play has been used with great success in both master's and executive education courses, with classes as small as 10 students and as large as 120 students. It can also be used with advanced undergraduate students.

The design of the role play affords great flexibility in terms of how it is used, as well as the number of class sessions required to use it effectively. I have found, however, that the role play works best when conducted over at least six hours of class time. While this may seem like a lot of time to allocate to a role play simulation, I have found that the learning generated by this exercise is well worth the time.

How the Role Play Works

Students are assigned to act as an administrator from one of the following organizations:

- 1) Ministry of Education (MoE)
- 2) Ministry of Religion and Cultural Affairs (MoRCA)
- 3) United Nations Assistance Mission in Adlabad (UNAMA)
- 4) United States Agency for International Development (USAID),
- 5) Revolutionary Association of the Women of Adlabad (RAWA)

The students are then assigned to an "RFP Team" consisting of at least one administrator from each of the five organizations. The teams must negotiate and respond to the Request for Proposals for addressing Adlabad's education development goals.

There are three education development goals: 1) Increasing student enrollment in primary school; 2) Increasing student enrollment in secondary school; and 3) Increasing the number of female teachers. Each development goal has three decision items: a core issue, the establishment of targets, and the outline of an implementation strategy.

At the conclusion of the negotiations, each RFP team must make a presentation to an "Advisory Committee" who then "awards" Project Management Contracts to the RFP Team with the best proposal. I have generally recruited colleagues and doctoral students to participate as members of the Advisory Committee.

Depending on the number of students in the course and the time allotted for the role play, the instructor may require RFP teams to address one, two, or all three development goals. Regardless of how many development goals are assigned for negotiation, more than one RFP Team should address each goal to enable competition among the teams and increase the likelihood of quality proposals. For example, in a course with 10 students, I created two RFP Teams that had to address all three development goals. In a course with over 100 students, I created nine RFP Teams, and assigned three teams to address development goal #1, three to address development goal #2, three to address development goal #3.

Instructors should pay attention to the details in the simulation materials, particularly the RFP and Instructions, and alter those details to meet course and teaching needs. For example, instructors can alter the number of development goals to be addressed in the RFP, the negotiation

procedures, and other details. Some areas where instructor decisions need to be made are in **[bold brackets]** in the role play; however, instructors should read the role play details closely and make changes throughout for consistency.

Role Plays Materials

All materials necessary for the role play are included. The students should be given two packets:

- 1) “Role Play Synopsis”, which includes a description of the scenario, the request for proposals and RFP worksheet, and instructions. (Instructors can modify these materials to meet teaching needs and objectives.)
- 2) “Confidential Organizational Information”, which includes a brief overview of the organizations participating in the negotiation, specific confidential information about each organization, and a role worksheet designed to help students digest their role and determine their positions, interests, and resources. (All students should receive the overview of organizations and the role worksheet. Students should be given confidential information only for the organization they have been assigned to represent.)

In addition to these packets, there are three short background documents that can be assigned to help students prepare for the negotiations. These readings provide information about the current state of education and educational needs in Adlabad. Instructors may wish to assign additional readings that relate to their specific teaching objectives and course.

The remainder of this teaching note has additional information that will be useful to the instructor, including suggestions for assignments and grading, ideas for debriefing the role play, and a “cheat sheet” that lists the positions, interests, and resources of each organization.

Assignments/Grading

Instructors should, of course, create and grade assignments to meet their teaching objectives. Below is the information I provide in my courses about assignments and grading.

- 1) Participation: You are expected to participate fully in all aspects of this role play, including attendance at all scheduled events. You must participate in the RFP Team negotiation process according to the information provided in your Confidential Organizational Information Sheet. It is your responsibility to defend your organizational objectives, but not to the detriment of the negotiation process. Participation grades will be calculated from self and peer assessment. You will be provided with a worksheet to use in these evaluations. Instructor observations will supplement these assessments.
- 2) Proposal Presentation: Each RFP Team will present their proposal at the Advisory Committee Hearings and submit copies of the one-page RFP worksheet. Although the presentations are an important part of this exercise, they are not graded.
- 3) Individual Reflection Paper: Each student will write a short (5 page) reflection piece in which s/he processes, analyzes, and interprets what s/he experienced in the role play with respect to the course themes. This paper is the major assignment in the role play.

Instructors should feel free to contact the author of this role play if they would like to see the peer evaluation sheet or reflection paper assignment.

Debriefing Note

There is tremendous flexibility in how the debriefing can be organized. The following questions are but a few possibilities that can be used to help launch discussion.

1. *What were your general experiences in this role play exercise?*
 - Probe for difficulties, roadblocks, “ah-ha” moments, breakthroughs, etc.
2. *What approaches to negotiation and conflict resolution did you see in your teams? How well did these approaches work?*
3. *What were some of the specific interpersonal, organizational, or interagency tensions that you experienced in your groups? How did these tensions impact the negotiation process?*
4. *How do these tensions relate to the themes and issues we have discussed in this course?*
5. *What role did power play in your negotiations? What type of power did each of the organizations have?*
 - Types of power might include money and other resources, political power, constituency power, negotiation prowess, etc.
6. *How have you seen or how do you anticipate seeing similar interpersonal, organizational, or interagency issues in your past or future work? Why?*
7. *How have you seen or how do you anticipate seeing similar issue tensions (i.e., the course themes) in your past or future work? Why?*
8. *What is the most important thing you learned in this exercise?*

Organizational “Cheat Sheet”

Organization	Positions and Interests	Values/ Resources
<p style="text-align: center;">Ministry of Education (MoE)</p>	<p>Rebuilding of educational infrastructure is the primary short-term goal. In terms of the DGs, there is a need to maximize efficiency and set “realistic” (i.e., low and easily attainable) targets for each development goal.</p> <p><i>Primary Education:</i> Co-ed; targets should be 15% for girls and 40% for boys.</p> <p><i>Secondary Education:</i> Ideally, co-ed; however, if necessary for girls to go to school, single sex is OK. Targets should be 15% for girls and 40% for boys.</p> <p><i>Female Teachers:</i> Teachers should be able to teach children of both genders in primary school; female teachers should only be allowed to teach girls in secondary school; Male teachers may teach students of any gender at any time. Target should be 15% female teachers.</p> <p>Organizational Security is a major goal: Want to retain core tasks and responsibilities so as to maintain MoE’s autonomy, authority, legitimacy, and capacity. Want to reduce threat of corruption through solid compensation of employees; Want to reduce fragmentation of ministry and lessen the burden on employees; Want to reach effective agreement that allows to demonstrate measurable progress</p>	<p>Education is the primary value. Need to revitalize education system and strengthen the MoE.</p> <p>Budget is tight, but does have a strong staff with solid local knowledge; many have been trained as professional public administrators with specialties in education.</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">Ministry of Religion and Cultural Affairs (MoRCA)</p>	<p>Wants to see prosperity of all Adlabad citizens, but realizes this won’t happen overnight. Sees education as playing a vital role in the redevelopment of Adlabad. Resources must be used efficiently, in a way that upholds Islam and cultural values, and that will produce long-term benefits for the overall social and economic development of Adlabad. The first focus must be on education for boys; the near term prosperity of the nation lies in their hands. Supports girls’ education over the long term, but believes should not be primary focus in the near term.</p> <p><i>Primary Education (Grades 1-6):</i> All schools must be single-sex. Targets should be 20% for girls and 70% for boys.</p> <p><i>Secondary Education (7-12):</i> All schools must be single-sex. Targets should be 5% for girls and 60% for boys.</p> <p><i>Female Teachers:</i> Consistent with the separate but equal view of gender, teachers may not work with students of the opposite sex. Moreover, given that the most important population to focus on at this time is boys, increasing the number of female teachers is not a main concern. Therefore, no target should be set.</p>	<p>Loyalty to Islam, MoRCA, Adlabad and new Constitution.</p> <p>Making choices that ensure prosperity and will lead to near-term development and growth is very important</p> <p>If negotiations are favorable to Islam and MoRCA, could get grants” from Islamic organizations to build madrassas for both boys and girls</p>

<p>United Nations Assistance Mission in Adlabad (UNAMA)</p>	<p>Goal is to “get the ball rolling” to build institutional capacity, sustainability and autonomy among Adlabad Ministries. Want to empower RAWA to help build civil society. Want financial support of USAID.</p> <p>Have no preferences about the gender of teachers and students; education in and of itself will lead to gender equality.</p> <p>Want realistic and attainable education goals, though prefers to err on the side of setting high targets. Targets are movable, and can be changed over time. Most important thing is to take the first steps in the right direction.</p> <p><i>Primary Education (Grades 1-6):</i> Autonomy dictates that this is an Adlabad choice, although you strongly believe in girls’ education and won’t support a decision that doesn’t build capacity. The enrollment targets for primary should be 40% for girls and 65% for boys.</p> <p><i>Secondary Education (7-12):</i> Autonomy requires this to be an Adlabad choice, as long as that choice builds capacity. Target enrollment levels for secondary school are 35% for girls and 75% for boys.</p> <p><i>Female Teachers:</i> Autonomy and capacity building are your number one goals, but believe that teachers should be able to work with children of any sex because is the best use of scarce resources and best way to help meet other development goals. Target is 20%.</p>	<p>UNAMA cardinal rule is capacity-building for Adlabad institutions.</p> <p>Whatever is negotiated in the RFP process must produce stronger and more sustainable Adlabad institutions, both in government and civil society. Hoping for gender equity in agreements.</p> <p>Has the support and expertise of many UN agencies, as long as that support favors the UNAMA mission.</p> <p>Have contact with network of Adlabad civil society and sympathetic NGOs</p>
<p>United States Agency for International Development (USAID)</p>	<p>Wants economic growth led by the private sector, a democratic and capable state governed by the rule of law, and the guarantee of basic services for its people. Sees education as critical to the long-term success and sustainability of efforts.</p> <p>Resources must be used efficiently and effectively and for the purposes to which they have been allocated. This means that USAID will support student enrollment and teacher recruitment efforts, not the building of schools, especially madrassas. Hesitant about the role of Islam in education – this could allow for rise of fundamentalism and terrorism.</p> <p>Want high targets that can be raised in 1-2 years.</p> <p><i>Primary Education (Grades 1-6):</i> Only co-ed schools (like in the west) make sense. Targets of 40% for girls and 60% for boys.</p> <p><i>Secondary Education (7-12):</i> Co-ed schools make the most sense. Targets of 40% for girls and 60% for boys.</p> <p><i>Female Teachers:</i> Teachers should be able to work with students of the opposite gender to best use resources and promote gender equity. Would be satisfied with target of 35%, but would like to raise target in the near future.</p>	<p>Goal is to build democratic institutions and increase the capacity of those institutions to perform in a participatory, accountable, responsible, and democratic manner.</p> <p>USAID has significant financial resources (in the billions) to grant to this effort. Unspoken rule is that the agency wants western standards and nothing “too Islamic”.</p>

<p>Revolutionary Association of the Women of Adlabad (RAWA)</p>	<p>Believe education is critical to establishing a democratic, secular nation.</p> <p>Want a successful negotiation because will help strengthen RAWA and give organization legitimacy. At same time, wary that the negotiations could undermine RAWA and co-opt the organization and its mission. The fear of persecution is very strong among RAWA members and affiliates.</p> <p>Number one goals are to achieve women's rights and gender equity</p> <p><i>Primary Education (Grades 1-6):</i> Given the rampant historical and cultural gender discrimination, girls will not succeed unless schools are single sex. Enrollment targets should be 100% for girls and 100% for boys. Nothing less than 100% enrollment will do.</p> <p><i>Secondary Education (7-12):</i> Girls will not succeed unless schools are single sex. This is especially true at the secondary school level, a time where when girls reach adolescence and are often traded by their families to men for meager dowries. Nothing less than 100% enrollment targets are acceptable.</p> <p><i>Female Teachers:</i> Consistent with the above argument, students will learn best from a teacher of the same sex. Moreover, the recruitment target should be 50% - any other target would be fundamentally unfair.</p>	<p>Supports revolutionary cause and ideology of RAWA: pro-democracy, pro-secularist and anti-fundamentalist</p> <p>RAWA has no financial resources, but it does have intimate knowledge about specific needs and how to connect with communities, with women and children, and with refugees.</p> <p>RAWA has a strong network of allies who could be valuable in recruiting teachers, particularly from refugee camps.</p> <p>If there is too much an Islamic bend to these negotiations and the decided agreements, it is unlikely that RAWA would offer such support. Its members would be too fearful.</p>
--	---	--